Initial

Downtown Parking Study

June 2017

City of Redlands
Initial Downtown Parking Study

Parking Study Area

For the purposes of this study, the borders of downtown are taken from the Downtown Planning Area delineated in the draft General Plan update and the draft Downtown Specific Plan. This area is roughly bounded by I-10 to the north, Church Street to the east, Texas Street to the west, and Citrus Avenue/Vine Street to the south. Within the downtown area, there is the Parking and Business Improvement Area roughly bounded by Redlands Boulevard to the north, 7th Street to the east, Orange Street to the west, and Vine Street to the south. Given the prevalence of historic structures in this area, on-site parking is not required, but two public parking lots are available to serve businesses – the Ed Hales parking lot on Redlands Boulevard and the Citrus Avenue parking garage. Please see Map A. While not part of the Parking and Business Improvement Area, a similar exemption from on-site parking requirements is contained in the Downtown Specific Plan for restaurants in historic structures east of Orange Street, west of 5th Street, north of Redlands Boulevard and south of the railroad tracks.

Inventory of Parking Spaces

The number of parking spaces downtown, both public and private, were inventoried. There are 586 spaces on City-owned parking lots including: the Ed Hales parking lot on Redlands Boulevard, the Citrus Avenue parking garage, the Orange Street parking lot, Centennial Plaza parking garage, the lot at Citrus Avenue and 4th Street, and a small lot on 7th Street north of Redlands Boulevard. In addition, the City has 1,915 on-street parking spaces of which 450 spaces are marked and 1,465 spaces are unmarked. There are 5,560 spaces on privately-owned property downtown including the 455 spaces under construction in the Packing House District shopping center located on the northwest corner of Eureka Street and Stuart Avenue. Parking spaces serving private residential uses were not included in the inventory. All total, the downtown area has about 8,000 public and private parking spaces. Please see Map B.

Utilization of Parking Spaces

A utilization study was performed by City staff during April to gauge the degree of usage of public and private spaces throughout the day and over multiple days. Any vehicle observed stationary in one of the inventoried spaces was considered in the utilization figures. The industry standard for optimized parking lot utilization is 90% (Parking Management Best Practices, APA Planners Press, 2006).
The results of the utilization analysis are portrayed in graphs below. Data was collected for the entire study area for both private and public spaces. For the public spaces, data was further collected for on-street parking and city-owned parking lots. The data was also analyzed for the “downtown core” which is the highly trafficked area adjacent to State Street where parking demand is the highest.

The graphs depict that the peak time of usage on most weekdays is between 12:00 pm and 2:00 pm when occupancy ranges between 90% - 100% for City lots and 60% - 70% for private lots within the downtown core. Please see Map C of the parking utilization “heat map.” Between 2:00 pm and 4:00 pm occupancy decreases slightly about 2% - 5%. After 5:00 pm, occupancy generally begins to decrease when some of the professional and service-type businesses close.

Exceptions to the typical parking utilization pattern include evenings when other large events are occurring downtown, such as Market Night. Not surprisingly, the heaviest period of usage is Thursday afternoons and evenings when Market Night occurs. There are two peak periods on this day, one between 12:00 pm and 2:00 pm as is normal, and another between 6:00 pm and 9:00 pm when Market Night is open. During these times, the average occupancy rates in City lots are at or above 100%, with the exception of the City-owned lot at Citrus Avenue and 4th Street which peaks at 75%. Private lots were approximately 95% filled in the downtown core during this time. The Redlands Mall parking lot reaches approximately 55% capacity from 12:00 pm to 2:00 pm on Thursdays and slightly decreases after 2:00 pm until 6:00 pm. Between 6:00 pm – 9:00 pm the Redlands Mall parking lot also reaches 100%, and private lots further from State Street such the lot at FedEx reach 90% occupancy.

The City has an agreement with the owner of Centennial Plaza to provide 53 parking spaces for public use. Some of these spaces are in the surface parking lot and some are in the garage. It should be noted that the parking garage rarely exceeds 25% full during peak hours, even during Market Night. It is the most underutilized parking structure downtown, but could be a valuable resource for longer term parking needs. The garage is surveilled with video cameras but there is no parking attendant. The posted signage at the entrances of the garage does not convey the availability of public parking. It is recommended that additional discussions occur with the owner to improve identification and access of the public parking spaces in this facility.

The majority of new development projects generally accommodate parking on-site under the current standards. But for older buildings, especially historic structures, with limited undeveloped area on their parcel, it can be difficult to meet the current parking standards. For those not within an exempted area, options are provided within the City Municipal Code to enable these structures to be renovated for new uses and meet a portion of their parking needs. These options include off-site parking (within a specified distance), shared parking (for businesses with different peak hours), tandem parking (for residential uses only), and payment of fees-in-lieu.
Paid Versus Unpaid Parking
The City does not charge for parking within downtown other than leasing a small number of spaces at the lot on 7th Street. A portion of the downtown core area is limited to two and three hour parking. This parking is monitored by the Police Department using the Turbo Data Systems software for ticket writing, processing and electronic data transfer. Paid parking is a controversial issue as some merchants and downtown patrons believe that it dissuades downtown business patronage. Other downtown merchants believe that paid parking, especially along State Street and Orange Street, would encourage more turn-over of spaces. It has been suggested by some downtown merchants that longer term parking for business owners, employees and longer term customers could be made available in the City-owned lots at Citrus Avenue, 7th Street, and Centennial Plaza. This would free up more short term spaces on State Street and Orange Street. Incentives could also be offered to encourage business owners and their employees to use longer term parking areas such as providing free long term parking, assigned spaces, improved security, and shuttle services.

Should the City Council wish to explore paid parking in heavily trafficked areas downtown, newer technology exists that does not require meters at each parking space. “Pay and Display” kiosks can be installed on each block that take a variety of payment methods including cash, credit cards, and automated payments with smartphones. Paid parking is typically not a major source of income for smaller cities the size of Redlands, but it can assist in covering parking enforcement and maintenance costs.

Potential Parking Actions

The number of parking spaces needed are dependent on land uses and those change over time. Ideally, ample parking is provided to meet the demand but not so much as to dominate the land use of the downtown. The optimized 90% parking lot utilization rate is a good target to set. To get the most utilization for investment, a strategy is suggested that prioritizes additional parking near the Business and Improvement District and near the historic structures along Orange Street where parking is not required on site. Another area of need in the future will be near the downtown rail station which will draw additional patrons and visitors. The majority of businesses downtown have parking on-site or will be required to include on-site parking when property is redeveloped.

Staff reviewed several options for increasing parking and circulation downtown and developed actions that could be implemented in the short term (1 to 2 years), mid-term (2 to 5 years), and long term (over 5 years). Below is a summary of those potential actions in the three phases, along with estimated costs and the potential number of spaces that could be added. Please see Map D, Phasing Map. A target was set of about 470 additional parking spaces for the near term and mid-term, the number of spaces that are currently part of the Redlands Mall and used as public parking.
Phase 1 – Potential Early Improvements (1 to 2 Years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Additional Spaces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Re-striping of top level of Citrus Avenue parking garage</td>
<td>Funded</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Striping of unmarked spaces downtown south of rail road tracks</td>
<td>$8,500 + staff time</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Expansion of Orange Street lot</td>
<td>Funded</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 7th Street parking lot expansion</td>
<td>$88,400</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Stuart Avenue parking lot development</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Additional public on-street spaces through private development</td>
<td>Privately funded</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Wayfinding signage</td>
<td>$5,000 – $20,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Security improvements (lighting, cameras, signage, etc.)</td>
<td>$65,000</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Pedestrian crossing safety improvements</td>
<td>Funded</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Parking consultant</td>
<td>TBD</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 RFP to downtown property owners for public parking proposals</td>
<td>Staff time</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Review and update parking standards</td>
<td>Staff time</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>$416,900+</strong></td>
<td><strong>301</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For the near term parking improvements, it is estimated that an additional 300+ spaces could be achieved along with greater access and use of existing parking spaces.

A cost-effective gain in increasing parking capacity includes striping unmarked, on-street, parallel parking spaces. Because they are unmarked, parking utilization in these areas is not usually the most efficient. Often a single vehicle occupies a space that could easily fit two vehicles. There is a potential 850 on-street, parallel parking spaces downtown in the area south of the railroad tracks if they are properly marked and utilized. Specifically, streets with a large number of unmarked spaces include Redlands Boulevard, West State Street, Oriental Avenue, Kendall Street, and portions of 5th, 6th, 7th, 8th, and 9th Streets. This is the area of highest demand. It is estimated that a 10% improvement in parking space capacity could yield 85 spaces from the 850 potential spaces that are in this area once they are marked.

In addition, an increase in parking spaces can be achieved by converting parking areas to diagonal parking with one way travel between isles. A portion of the Orange Street parking lot is being converted to diagonal parking to add 11 spaces to the 47 spaces currently existing. In addition, a project is underway to restripe the top deck of the Citrus Avenue parking garage. This effort will add 7 additional spaces. Staff is also examining the possibility of converting the on-street, parallel parking spaces on 6th, 7th, 8th, and 9th Streets between Redlands Boulevard and Citrus Avenue to diagonal spaces with one-way travel. However, given the right-of-way availability in this area, it is difficult to meet the municipal code and safety standards for travel lane widths –
especially access for fire department vehicles. Moreover, the additional parking spaces provided in such a conversion would be limited given the number of driveways and alley entrances that are required to be accessible. Staff continues to investigate alternative designs for this area.

The City owns approximately 1 acre of land north of Redlands Boulevard between 7th Street and 9th Street. A portion of this property contains a 56 space parking lot. This parcel could be built out with 91 parking spaces for a net gain of 35 spaces. The lot is in close proximity to downtown and is ideal for longer term parking needs especially for business owners and their employees. The lot could also serve as “trail head” parking for the future Zanja trail which will terminate on the east side of 9th Street.

The City owns approximately 1.5 acres along Stuart Avenue next to the future rail station. It is estimated that 145 spaces could be built on this property as a surface lot. The City has an obligation to provide 200 spaces in proximity of the rail station by the year 2020. Development of a surface lot would not preclude the redevelopment of the parking lot as a public garage or as a commercial/mixed-use project with public parking in the future.

While not directly yielding additional parking spaces, there are several projects the City can undertake to improve wayfinding, access, security, and pedestrian circulation downtown. These improvements help with gaining efficiency and capacity in existing parking areas by allowing visitors to “park once” and easily move around downtown to various destinations without having to re-park.

Directional signage that indicates the location of public parking and which lots are longer term would be helpful to downtown merchants, employees, customers, and visitors. Often it is difficult to tell which lots are public and which lots are private downtown. Standardized public parking signage would assist in identification. Ideally, this signage would be part of a comprehensive wayfinding signage program that helps visitors get to other important landmarks and destinations throughout downtown and the City.

Some parking areas, such as the Centennial Plaza parking garage, are underutilized given the concerns crossing major streets such as Redlands Boulevard and Orange Street. To make it easier for pedestrians to cross these busy thoroughfares, the City will be installing rectangular rapid flashing beacons (RRFBs) at uncontrolled crossings on Redlands Boulevard and Orange Street. Once activated, these lights emit a flashing beacon warning drivers to stop for pedestrians who are crossing the street. This project has been funded with Highway Safety Improvement Program (HSIP) grant funds.

Other improvements could involve the installation of lighting, cameras, and signage, and vegetation maintenance to improve safety and the “sense of safety” at downtown parking areas. Parking lots and garages that are well-lit, monitored, and “feel safe” become more utilized for longer term parking needs. Staff toured the public parking lots with members of the Police Department to obtain recommendations on safety improvements. These safety improvements include installation of lighting, monitoring signage, cameras with one-way speakers, and tree
trimming to improve visibility. These improvements could be phased in over several years depending on budget availability.

Developing an overall long term parking strategy will require the expertise of a consultant to assist with planning, design, and financing of additional parking lots and structures downtown. This expertise could assist in planning a comprehensive parking solution for downtown, implementation of new parking technology, and planning the long term financing for such facilities.

In Phase 1, it is recommended that the City issue a Request for Proposals (RFP) to downtown property owners to solicit alternative parking solutions that go beyond City-owned properties. This RFP would be aimed at private property owners that would be interested in selling, leasing, or partnering with the City to develop additional public parking either as a stand-alone parking lot or structure, or as a part of a development project. Such an RFP may open up potential parking solutions that the City is unaware of. The City would not be obligated to select any proposal or move forward with implementation if the proposals lacked viability or an adequate return on investment.

In addition, a review of the parking standards for downtown should be made. Specifically, an examination is needed in instances when a proposed use that would require a much more intensive amount of parking beyond the typical norm governed by the parking standards is permitted by right downtown. Uses such as these have the potential to create very high demands for parking spaces in areas of limited availability, such as the Business and Parking Improvement District. Such uses include assembly halls and live entertainment venues. In order to properly analyze the impacts on public parking, these types of uses may be better examined as a conditional use rather than ones permitted by right.

In addition, revised parking standards have been drafted for the downtown area that are part of the Draft Downtown Specific Plan. These standards amend some to the current parking standards to simplify them and take into account other forms of mobility such as pedestrian, bicycle, and transit riders on parking requirements. These standards would be included in the revision to the Downtown Specific Plan.

### Phase 2 – Potential Mid-term Improvements (2 to 5 Years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Additional Spaces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Ed Hales Parking Garage</td>
<td>$3,865,000</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Additional on-street parking with private development</td>
<td>Private funding</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Downtown parking shuttle</td>
<td>$150,000 + Staff</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>$4,015,000 +</strong></td>
<td><strong>181</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is estimated that a gain of 180+ spaces could be achieved during the mid-term. Mid-term improvements could involve the development of additional parking lots and garages. At this time, the City-owned parking lot at Ed Hales Park is one of the better candidates to be redeveloped as a parking garage. It could be designed as a three-level structure with one level being partially underground and two levels above. Its location is central to the State Street area and could serve longer term parking needs freeing up on-street spaces. A three level garage in this location could produce a total of 163 spaces (101 new spaces over the current number of 62). A basic parking garage structure in this location is estimated to cost approximately $4 million. Any new parking garages should be constructed so that they could be converted or partially converted to other uses in the future should the demand for parking decrease.

In addition, there are vacant lots and under-utilized lots throughout downtown that will be privately developed or redeveloped in the future. As with the Packing House District shopping center, these projects will be required to build out the full street section along their frontages. Typically, the planned street sections of most downtown roads includes parallel parking in the public right-of-way. It is estimated that such projects could produce an additional 80 on-street spaces over this time period. Many of these spaces will be in the northern and western parts of downtown where the most undeveloped area exists. It should also be noted, that any private development or redevelopment in these areas will have to meet current parking requirements which will increase the number of private parking spaces. In addition, as these areas build out, improvements will be made to create pleasant walking environments for pedestrians that encourage greater accessibility to downtown locations and more remote parking areas.

During this mid-term period, it is expected that there will be several large construction projects downtown that will significantly impact the availability of parking, such as redevelopment of the Redlands Mall, and development around the Santa Fe Depot / West Stuart Avenue area. A shuttle that circulates throughout downtown connecting the public parking areas with highly trafficked destinations would enable downtown employees, patrons and visitors to park once and access multiple sites downtown throughout the day. A 12 passenger bus with two ADA tie downs costs approximately $75,000 new. Used vehicles would be less. A minimum number of two shuttles is needed factoring down time for servicing or repairs. Staffing would depend on the desired number and frequency (“headway”) of shuttles serving downtown. Ideally, the shuttle would minimally serve the times of highest demand - between 11 am and 7 pm - with a headway interval of 15 minutes or less. Depending on use, the shuttle system could become a permanent amenity downtown.

Phase 3 – Potential Long term Improvements (5+ Years)

Longer term, there are opportunities for the City to partner with the private sector to develop additional public parking or purchase property to develop as additional lots or garages. These
could be parking facilities that are part of a commercial, office, or mixed-use development project. Potential sites include the Stuart Avenue property next to the rail tracks, Redlands Mall, the Civic Center complex, and redevelopment of the Citrus Avenue parking garage. As discussed in Phase 1, an RFP to solicit interests from downtown property owners may produce more potential locations throughout downtown. Financing or incentives could be provided to encourage private developers to incorporate additional public parking within their developments over the parking required for their uses.

**New Technologies**

Throughout all three phases, it is recommended that the City continue to monitor innovations in vehicular travel and parking technology. Car hire services such as Uber and Lyft are already alleviating the demand for parking in some downtown areas, especially in the evening. Self-driving or autonomous vehicles have the potential to reduce the amount of parking as well. Though the technology is still evolving, significant progress continues to be made and companies such as Google® are testing out autonomous vehicle use between their facilities and transit stations.

Newer, automated parking garages that use robotic elevators can increase the number of spaces per square feet over conventional parking garages. These may prove to be cost competitive solutions in the future. Other technologies that better inform the driver if parking is available in a garage exists today. This technology uses automated sensors to detect the number of available spaces and display that number on a marquee sign at the garage entrance informing drivers of availability. While some of these technologies are still evolving, they have the potential to impact the amount of parking needed and the efficiency with which it is utilized. The City should regularly research and monitor the application of these technologies.

**Financing**

A variety of financing strategies exist to fund additional parking downtown. The City has created a downtown parking fund in which the sale of City property downtown would be used to provide additional parking. Another option is public financing through bonds. A bond financing option for parking garages could be included in a more general bond package to finance a new Safety Hall/Civic Center complex.

Special fees as part of business licenses were once used to finance parking lots in the downtown area. Special assessments through a Community Facilities District (CFD) is another option. A CFD would be at the owner’s request and the owner pays the costs incurred with creation of a CFD and any issuance of special tax bonds to fund parking improvements.
Similar to a CFD, an Enhanced Infrastructure Financing District (IEFD) uses a form of Tax Increment Financing (TIF) to fund improvements within a defined area upon the majority vote of property owners. While generally used for regional projects involving multiple governments, an IEFD can be used by a single government entity.

Cost recovery through paid parking is another option. While generally not a large revenue stream for smaller cities, such funds could be used to offset parking enforcement and maintenance costs.

Leasing strategies include both capital leases (lease to own) as well as operating leases (maintenance oriented public-private partnership). Public/private partnerships (P3s) are another mechanism whereby the City’s funds could be used to leverage development of additional public parking. Some P3 models include: Build-Own-Operate-Transfer, Design-Build-Finance-Operate-Maintain, Concession, and Divestiture.
Average Downtown Parking Usage at Peak Hours

Legend
- Downtown Study Area
- Parking and Business Improvement Area
- Parcels
- 0% - 25%
- 25% - 50%
- 50% - 75%
- 75% - 85%
- 85% - 95%
- 95% - 100%
Downtown Parking Improvements Phasing Plan

Legend:
- Downtown
- Parking and Business Improvement Area
- Parcels

Phase 1:
- Parking Lots
- Marking of unmarked parking spaces

Phase 2:
- Parking Garages
- Marking of unmarked spaces
- Possible Shuttle Route

Projects:
- Stuart Ave. Parking Lot
- Orange St. Parking Lot Expansion
- 7th St. Parking Lot Expansion
- Ed Hales Parking Garage
- Restripe upper level of deck of Citrus Avenue garage
- Marking of unmarked spaces

Transit Station
Traffic Light
Rapid Flashing Beacon