

MINUTES: of the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission (HSPC) meeting of the City of Redlands held of May 3, 2018, at 6:00 p.m. are as follows:

MEMBERS Kurt Heidelberg, Chairman
PRESENT: Shan McNaughton, Vice Chairman
Kristine Brown, Commissioner
Angela H. Keller, Commissioner

STAFF Brian Desatnik, Development Service Director
PRESENT: Brian Foote, Planning Manager
Loralee Farris, Principal Planner
Sean Reilly, Associate Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER AND PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD - 3 MINUTES

Chairman Kurt Heidelberg, called the meeting to order, and opened the Public Comment period. There were no comments forthcoming and the Public Comment period was closed. Chairman Heidelberg welcomed Commissioner Angela H. Keller to the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission.

II. ATTENDANCE

All Commissioners were present, with the exception of Commissioner Alison Roedl and Commissioner Nathan Gonzales.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Minutes of March 1, 2018

It was moved by Vice Chairman Shan Mc Naughton, seconded by Commissioner Kristine Brown and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) to approve the minutes of March 1, 2018.

IV. OLD BUSINESS – None

V. NEW BUSINESS

A. **MICHAEL D. LOGAN, APPLICANT**
(PROJECT PLANNER: SEAN REILLY)

1. Consideration of a Notice of Exemption pursuant to Sections 15301 (I)(4) (Existing Facilities), 15303(e) (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures), and 15331 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation) of the California Environmental Quality Act Guidelines.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider **Demolition No. 299** to demolish an approximately 857 square foot accessory building over 50 years of age, located at 28 W. Highland Avenue within the R-S (Suburban Residential) District (APN: 0173-241-14-0000).

3. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider **Certificate of Appropriateness No. 560** to construct an approximately 850 square foot detached garage in the rear yard of the property located within the West Highland Avenue Historic and Scenic District at 28 West Highland Avenue in the R-S (Suburban Residential) District (APN: 0173-241-14-0000).

Mr. Sean Reilly, Associate Planner, gave a brief description of Demolition No. 299 and Certificate of Appropriateness No. 560.

Chairman Heidelberg opened the Public Hearing.

Vice Chairman McNaughton stated that if the clipped gables were eliminated from the garage it would give the house more prominence. Vice Chairman McNaughton recommended adding an additional condition to reference the option of eliminating the clipped gables.

Chairman Heidelberg closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman Mc Naughton, seconded by Commissioner Brown and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission had determined that Demolition Permit No. 299 was exempt from review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15301(1)(4) of the CEQA guidelines.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman Mc Naughton, Seconded by Commissioner Brown and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission had determined that the Certificate of Appropriateness No. 560 was exempt from review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15303(e) of the CEQA guidelines.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman Mc Naughton, Seconded by Commissioner Brown and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission adopted Resolution No. 2018-02, and approved Demolition Permit No. 299, based on the facts within this staff report and subject to the Conditions of Approval.

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairman Mc Naughton, Seconded by Commissioner Brown and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission found that Certificate of Appropriateness No. 560 was not detrimental to the Historic Resource and therefore adopted Resolution No. 2018-03, approving Certificate of Appropriateness No. 560 based on the facts within this staff report and subject to the Conditions of Approval this includes the modified Condition of Approval No. 3 as follows:

*All plans submitted to the City as part of the building permit application shall reflect the plans submitted on February 27, 2018 for this Certificate of Appropriateness, and shall comply with all provisions of the Redlands Municipal Code. **The applicant at his discretion may exclude the clipped gables as shown on the project plans.***

**B. VANTAGE ONE REAL ESTATE INVESTMENTS V, APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: SEAN REILLY)**

1. Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council on a Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring/Reporting Program prepared in accordance with Section 15074 of the California Environmental Quality Act.
2. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Demolition No. 281**, to demolish a 21,500 square foot structure over 50 years of age, known as the "Redlands Safety Hall" located at 212 Brookside Avenue (APNs: 0171-101-01-0000 through 05-0000, 0171-221-17-0000 and 0171-211-25-0000) within the A-P (Administrative and Professional Office) District.
3. **PUBLIC HEARING** to consider a recommendation to the City Council on **Demolition No. 282**, to demolish an 11,800 square foot structure over 50 years of age, known as the "San Bernardino County Courthouse building" located at 216 Brookside Avenue (APNs: 0171-211-13-0000 through 0171-211-21-0000) within the A-P (Administrative and Professional Office) District.

Mr. Sean Reilly, Associate Planner, gave a brief description of Demolition No. 281 and Demolition No. 282.

Mr. Tom Robinson, applicant, came forward to address the Commission. Mr. Robinson stated that he is mindful of the community and the future replacement structure will be an asset to the downtown area. Mr. Robinson concurred with the conditions of approval and was available for questions.

Chairman Heidelberg opened the Public Hearing.

Vice Chairman McNaughton requested additional information on the architect and structure.

Mr. Robert White, Archaeological Associates, representative gave a brief background of the architectural and historical significance of the Redlands Safety Hall. Mr. White stated that C. Paul Ulmer was a local architect and Mr. Ulmer had budget restraints when designing the structures.

Mr. Robinson, applicant, introduced Mr. Michael Day, grandson of the local architect, Mr. Clare Henry Day, to the Commission.

Mr. Robinson, the applicant, read a written quotation from Mr. Clare Henry Day, a local architect, regarding the Safety Hall and court house. The comment is summarized into the record as follows: The buildings do not represent significant architectural value. The property, including the parking area, is obsolete in function and appearance and is ready for an upgrade of architectural and community merit, offering an opportunity for development on a prominent site. The Safety Hall and court house were designed and constructed to be cost effective utilitarian buildings and neither are architecturally unique, nor were any special materials used or construction techniques employed. Consequently neither building appears to be eligible for Redlands Historical under Criteria "C".

Ms. Debbie Stobaugh, resident, is in support of the demolition of the Safety Hall and the court house.

Ms. Tracy Gossert and Ms. Denise Verdugo from the State Street Salon are in support of the demolitions. Ms. Gossert and Ms. Verdugo stated that the unoccupied buildings attract the homeless. The conditions are unsafe for the salon employees and customers.

Commissioner Angela Keller, recommended an additional condition for archeological testing prior to the demolitions.

Mr. Pat Meyer, representative, concurred with the additional condition for archeological testing prior to the demolitions.

Mayor Pro Tem Paul Barich, stated he is interested in seeing the site developed.

Chairman Heidelberg closed the Public Hearing

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Brown, seconded by Vice Chairman McNaughton and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission found that there was no substantial evidence of any potentially significant environmental effects to any historic resources, and recommended that the City Council adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration prepared for the proposed project.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Brown, seconded by Vice Chairman McNaughton and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission adopted Resolution No.2018-04 recommending approval of Demolition Permit No. 281, subject to the Conditions of Approval as amended for Mitigation Measure No.13.

~~Mitigation Measure CUL-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, evidence that a qualified professional archaeologist has been retained by the applicant shall be provided to the Development Services Department. If prehistoric or historic resources over fifty (50) years of age are encountered during demolition, then activities in the immediate area of the find shall be halted so that the archaeologist can assess the find. Work shall not continue at the discovery site until the archaeologist conducts sufficient research and data collection to make a determination that the resource is either 1) not cultural in origin; or 2) not potentially significant or eligible for listing on the NRHP or CRHR.~~

Mitigation Measure CUL 2: Discovery of Cultural Resources during Demolition. Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, the applicant shall prepare a site testing plan to be approved by the City Planning Division and perform site testing for the entire site. Testing shall be done for the presence of cultural resources to a depth beyond the previously disturbed soil depth as determined by the geotechnical report. If buried cultural resources materials are encountered during testing, the (project) archaeologist shall inspect the find in accordance with federal, state, and local guidelines, to determine if the find is historic (i.e., 50 years of age or older) or qualifies for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old pursuant to California Code of Regulations Section 4852.

If the project archaeologist determines the find is not historic (50 years of age or older) or does not qualify for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old, no further evaluation shall be required. However, if the project archaeologist determines the find is 50 years of age or older or may qualify for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old, Mitigation Measure CUL-3 shall apply. This measure shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the City's Planning Division.

MOTION

It was moved by Commissioner Brown, seconded by Vice Chairman McNaughton and carried on a 4-0 vote (Commissioner Gonzales and Commissioner Roedl absent) that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission adopted Resolution No.2018-05 recommending approval of Demolition Permit No. 282, subject to the attached Conditions of Approval as amended for Mitigation Measure No. 13.

~~Mitigation Measure CUL-1 Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, evidence that a qualified professional archaeologist has been retained by the applicant shall be provided to the Development Services Department. If prehistoric or historic resources over fifty (50) years of age are encountered during demolition, then activities in the immediate area of the find shall be halted so that the archaeologist can assess the find. Work shall not continue at the discovery site until the archaeologist conducts sufficient research and data collection to make a determination that the resource is either 1) not cultural in origin; or 2) not potentially significant or eligible for listing on the NRHP or CRHR.~~

13. Mitigation Measure CUL 2: Discovery of Cultural Resources during Grading. Prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, the applicant shall prepare a site testing plan to be approved by the City Planning Division and perform site testing for the entire site. Testing shall be done for the presence of cultural resources to a depth beyond the previously disturbed soil depth as determined by the geotechnical report. If buried cultural resources materials are encountered during testing, the (project) archaeologist shall inspect the find in accordance with federal, state, and local guidelines, to determine if the find is historic (i.e., 50 years of age or older) or qualifies for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old pursuant to California Code of Regulations Section 4852.

If the project archaeologist determines the find is not historic (50 years of age or older) or does not qualify for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old, no further evaluation shall be required. However, if the project archaeologist determines the find is 50 years of age or older or may qualify for exceptional significance if less than 50 years old, Mitigation Measure CUL-3 shall apply. This measure shall be implemented to the satisfaction of the City's Planning Division.

A. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS PROVIDED BY CITY STAFF

1. Staff announced that May is preservation month and the Redlands Historic Preservation Fortnight event is scheduled for May 14, 2018 through May 27, 2018 this event is hosted by the Redlands Conservancy and the Redlands area Historical Society. Additional information can be found on the Redlands Conservancy website at redlandsconservancy.org.
2. Planning Manager Brian Foote announced that the City Council approved local designation of the Mutual Orange Company Packing Plant building as a historic property.
3. Development Services Director, Brian Desatnik, stated that the department is in the process of hiring the Consultant firm ARG Consultants to update the Architectural and Historic Design Guidelines, which will include historic styles and incorporate 1950 century buildings.

B. COMMISSIONER ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chairman Heidelberg recommended that projects that include cultural reports be sent to the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commissioners for comments.

Development Services Director Brian Desatnik agreed to send the cultural reports to the Commission for comments.

VII. ADJOURNMENT TO THE MEETING OF JUNE 7, 2018

The meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m. to the regularly scheduled Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission meeting of June 7, 2018.

Respectfully Submitted,



Joni Mena
Senior Administrative Technician



Lorelee Farris
Principal Planner