

MINUTES: of the Special Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission (HSPC) meeting of the City of Redlands held on December 17, 2020, at 6:00 p.m. are as follows:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kurt Heidelberg, Chairman
Angela Keller, Vice Chairwoman
Steven Holm, Commissioner
Kristine Brown, Commissioner
Greg Weissman, Commissioner

STAFF PRESENT: Brian Desatnik, Director
Brian Foote, Planning Manager
Loralee Farris, Principal Planner
Ivan Flores, Assistant Planner

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ATTENDANCE

Chairman Kurt Heidelberg, called the meeting to order, the Commission was in full attendance with the exception of Commissioner Lauren Bricker and Commissioner Nathan Gonzales who were recused.

II. CEREMONIAL MATTERS - None

III. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

(In accordance with the San Bernardino County Health Officer's Order, social distancing practices will be observed. Following public health recommendations to limit public gatherings during the Covid-19 pandemic, City Manager Charles M. Duggan, Jr., acting as the City of Redlands Emergency Services Director has directed that Historic and Scenic Board meetings be closed to the public until further notice or until the current local State of Emergency has been lifted. Chairperson Heidelberg will read all public comments, up to 250 words, into record if they are received in accordance with the deadlines stated above.)

Chairman Heidelberg inquired if there were any Public Comments and opened up the Public Comment Period. Mr. Brian Foote, Planning Manager, stated there were no Public Comments forthcoming. Chairman Heidelberg closed the Public Comment Period.

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Meeting Minutes of October 15, 2020

MOTION

It was moved by Vice Chairwoman Angela Keller and seconded by Commissioner Kristine Brown and carried a vote of 5-0 (Commissioner Bricker and Commissioner Gonzales recused) to approve the October 15th, 2020 Historic & Scenic Preservation Commission meeting minutes.

V. OLD BUSINESS

A. REDLANDS PALM INVESTMENT, LLC, APPLICANT
(PROJECT PLANNER: SEAN REILLY)

A recommendation to the Planning Commission on the impact to cultural resources for Tentative Parcel Map No. 20185, Tentative Tract Map No. 20305, and Conditional Use Permit No. 1143 which concerns the subdivision of a 8.8-acre parcel located at 301 W. Palm Avenue to develop a Planned Residential Development with a total of 30 new residential lots for new single-family development in the R-S (Suburban Residential) District.

Chairman Heidelberg opened the Hearing and inquired if there were any Public Comments on the item.

Mr. Sean Reilly, Senior Planner, confirmed there were 6 Public Comment letters received that were opposed to the project from Mr. Gustavo Chapparo, Mr. Stuart Sweet, Mr. Richard O'Donnell, Ms. Luanne Benton, Ms. Cynthia Hoghaug, and Mr. Randy Wilson & Ms. Johanna Wilson. The letters of opposition are on file in the Development Services Department and have been summarized below:

Gustavo Chapparo – Expressed concern regarding the proposed density of the residential development and recommended the project be revised to propose 15 homes or less; expressed concern regarding the lack of adequate perimeter walls and setbacks; noted his opposition to the project.

Stuart Sweet – Indicated a concern that the applicant's renderings were may not display an accurate representation of the proposed project; expressed concern about the applicant's lack of communication with the surrounding neighbors and indicating dismay that the applicant has not revised plans to incorporate neighborhood feedback; noted his opposition to the project.

Randy and Johanne Wilson – Expressed concern regarding the removal of citrus groves and indicated their support for retaining scenic properties in residential areas, intact; noted their opposition to the project.

Richard O'Donnell – Expressed concern regarding the health of the citrus trees on site and disapproval of the removal of the grove and its gravity fed irrigation system; indicated providing a 'kiosk like' interpretive center and documentation with black and white photographs and drawings was inadequate; advocated for preservation of the site.

Luanne Benton – Expressed concerns regarding the proposed density, lot sizes, variances, lack of watering done with the existing grove, a gated community, and the incompatibility with proposed block wall; advocated towards leaving several rows of orange trees along Palm Avenue; noted opposition to the project.

Cynthia Hoghaug – Expressed concern regarding the lack of changes to the proposed project to address concerns regarding historic integrity; indicated concerns regarding the proposed density, variance requests, reduced setbacks, the influx of rodents and wildlife related to construction; noted opposition to the project.

Mr. Reilly gave an overview and presentation on the proposal, and stated the applicant has a presentation.

Mr. Pete Pitassi, principal, stated they have Mr. Matt Jordan, Mr. Nolan Leggio, Mr. Mark Ostoich from Gresham Savage, and Mr. Pat Meyer and they are available for any questions. Mr. Pitassi gave an overview and presentation on the proposal.

Chairman Heidelberg inquired if the Commission needed any clarification on the proposal. Commissioner Steven Holm asked which parcel will have the citrus trees. Mr. Reilly clarified.

Chairman Heidelberg summarized some of the reoccurring concerns and recommendations as follows:

- The Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission (HSPC) acknowledged that the property is eligible for the California Register of Historical Resources and the City of Redlands Historic Register.
- Few extant citrus estates are comparable to the project site and still have all the distinguishing characteristics of citrus grove estates.
- The project applicant proposes to remove the majority of the orange groves which are important character defining elements to citrus groves estates.
- The project applicant proposes to remove irrigation and structural features that are contributing elements to the property and its eligibility.
- The walls, gates, and fences as a perimeter treatment are not typical to the period or the property and have substantial visual impacts.
- The housing proposal is dense for the time period and further diminishes the historical setting.
- The removal of character defining features are considered to be significant impacts
- The Commission does not agree that there are no adverse changes.
- Initial Study Mitigated Negative Declaration (ISMND) should not be considered adequate until additional analysis and mitigation is incorporated as previously noted by the Commission.

Vice Chairwoman Keller agreed with Chairman Heidelberg and expressed concern that there was not adequate mitigation to cultural and historic resources, and confirmed there needs to be additional documentation. Vice Chairwoman Keller noted that remaining citrus estates were rare in the City and this property was one of the only estates remaining.

Commissioner Holmes agreed with Chairman Heidelberg and stated the barn is significant and asked for additional background.

Chairman Heidelberg inquired if it is appropriate to take action at this meeting on this item or whether the project would need to return to the Commission again. Director Brian Desatnik stated staff will summarize the Commission's concerns and recommendations and will bring back a resolution to the HSPC.

Council Member Paul Barich noted two other citrus grove estates in the City, the Buoye estate and the Farquhar estate.

Commissioner Weissman stated the Buoye and Farquhar estates are in East Redlands and this property is in South Redlands and expressed the concern that the loss of this citrus grove will forever change this neighborhood.

Chairman Heidelberg stated staff will bring back a resolution on January 7th, 2021 to the HSPC and there is no motion required at this time. Chairman Heidelberg closed the Hearing.

VI. NEW BUSINESS - None

VII. DISCUSSION, POSSIBLE ACTION, AND INFORMATION ITEMS

A. Informational items provided by City Staff

There were no informational items provided by City Staff.

B. Commissioner Announcements

Council Member Barich thanked the Commission for their dedication on the preservation of the City of Redlands.

VIII. ADJOURN TO REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING ON JANUARY 7, 2020

Chairman Heidelberg adjourned the meeting at 6:52 p.m. to the regularly scheduled meeting on January 7th, 2020.



Linda McCasland
Administrative Analyst

Lorelee Farris
Principal Planner