

REQUEST FOR HISTORIC AND SCENIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION ACTION

VI.A. REDLANDS PALM INVESTMENT, LLC, APPLICANT

A review of the Cultural Resources Assessment/Historic Resource Evaluation related to Tentative Parcel Map No. 20185, Tentative Tract Map No. 20305, and Conditional Use Permit No. 1143 for the subdivision of an 8.8-acre parcel located at 301 W. Palm Avenue to develop a Planned Residential Development with a total of 30 new residential lots for new single-family development in the R-S, Suburban Residential District. The historic resources evaluation assessed the following extant features: the existing England/Attwood Estate house, Carriage House, Grove Barn, and England Cottage located at 301 W. Palm Ave.; the existing single-family residence located at 827 Alvarado St.; and associated remnant citrus grove, gravity irrigation system, and stone wall along a portion of the property boundary. The project is subject to the California Environmental Quality Act, and an Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared in accordance with Sections 15072, 15073, and 15074 of the CEQA Guidelines.

HISTORIC AND SCENIC PRESERVATION MEETING: MARCH 4, 2021

Planner: Sean Reilly, Senior Planner

SYNOPSIS

1. Historic Designation: The property is not designated as historic by the City of Redlands, the State of California, or the United States Government.
2. Existing Land Use: The site is approximately 8.8-acres and is occupied by two single-family residences, accessory structures and an orange grove.
3. Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission submittal dates:
 - (A) Date Submitted: December 11, 2019
 - (B) Date Accepted as Complete: December 10, 2020
 - (C) Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission Meeting (Continued): October 1, 2020
 - (D) Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission Meeting (Continued): October 15, 2020
 - (E) Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission Meeting (Continued): December 17, 2020
 - (F) Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission Meeting: March 4, 2021

4. Attachments:

- (A) Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission Resolution 2021-01

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant, Redlands Palm Investment, LLC, is proposing to subdivide an 8.8-acre parcel located at 301 W. Palm Avenue to develop a planned residential development. Referred to as the England/Attwood Estate, the subject property is located at the southeast corner of Palm Avenue and Alvarado Street in the southern portion of the City. Currently the project site is occupied by an orange grove, two single-family homes, and accessory structures associated with the homes and the operation of the grove.

BACKGROUND

The Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission (the "HSPC") reviewed the Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration, the Cultural Resource Assessment and the Historic Resource Evaluation related to the potential impacts to cultural resources at its meetings of October 1, October 15, and December 17, 2020.

At its meeting of October 1, 2020, the HSPC expressed concern regarding the potential impact to cultural and historic resources under the California Environmental Quality Act and recommended that additional analysis and mitigation was necessary to ensure the project would not result in a substantial adverse change to an historic resource. The HSPC provided guidance to the applicant in addressing areas of concerns related to the impact to the historic integrity aspect of setting, the addition of the proposed park as a conjectural feature that did not relate to the historic use of the property as a citrus estate, the potential visual impact related to the location and visibility of walls and fences, and the need to further substantiate structures that the Cultural Resource Assessment indicated were non-contributing. The HSPC and applicant agreed on a continuance to allow the applicant the opportunity to address the HSPC's concerns.

On October 15, 2020, the HSPC held a special meeting to review the applicant's supplemental memorandum, prepared by BCR Consulting, LLC, dated October 14, 2020. The memorandum provided clarification on the conclusions made in the Cultural Resources Assessment but did not provide any additional mitigation. The HSPC reviewed the memorandum and provided comments to the applicant, indicating that the memorandum did not provide additional identification, analysis, or mitigation to the impacts to the property that were raised by the HSPC and in public comments at its meeting of October 1, 2020. Commissioners provided guidance to the applicant on the appropriate forms of documentation of historic resources. The applicant requested that

the HSPC table the review of the project so that it could be brought back to a subsequent meeting with additional information.

On December 17, 2020, the HSPC held a second special meeting for the project and reviewed the applicant's second supplemental memorandum, by BRC Consulting LLC, dated November 5, 2020, which continued to assert that the project, as designed, would treat the historic resources in a manner that is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards and thus there was no need for mitigation to cultural and historic resources. The memorandum did, however, suggest enhancement measures, including the preparation of a Historic American Landscapes Survey (HALS) and the creation of an interpretive center on-site.

The HSPC agreed with the memorandum's statement that the citrus grove surrounding the houses is an important context for the historic resources and relates to the property's historic role, character, and spatial relationships. The HSPC, however, disagreed with the memorandum's conclusion that the project treats the historic resources in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards. The HSPC stated that the retention of additional portions of the citrus grove, where visible from Palm Avenue, to retain the appearance, character and feeling of the property's historic type, (as a citrus estate) was necessary to avoid adverse impacts to the historic setting. The HSPC disagreed with the applicant's opinion that retention of 20% of the citrus grove was sufficient to avoid adverse impacts. The HSPC thus concluded that the project, as designed, was not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards resulting in a substantial adverse change in the significance of the historic resource under CEQA Guidelines Section 16064.5(b).

Staff has prepared a resolution (Attachment A) reflecting the deliberations of the HSPC with regard to project impacts related to the Cultural Resources Assessment. The Commission is being asked to review the resolution, amend it if necessary, and adopt it. Staff will transmit the resolution to the Planning Commission in its consideration of the project and adequacy of the environmental document.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff requests that the HSPC review and discuss the resolution prepared for the project.

MOTION:

"I move that the Historic and Scenic Preservation Commission adopt Resolution No. 2021-01, finding that the Mitigated Negative Declaration and Cultural Resources Assessment prepared for Tentative Parcel Map No. 20185, Tentative Tract Map No. 20305, and Conditional Use Permit

No. 1143, for the subdivision of an 8.8-acre parcel located at 301 W. Palm Avenue does not adequately address impacts to Cultural and Historic Resources”